

**A Literature Review of Certain Texts
Written by Father John Harvey**

Father Robert McTeigue, SJ, PhD

November 2018

Preliminary Note

The following pages contain the complete report of Father Robert McTeigue on various writings of Father John F. Harvey, O.S.F.S., on the subjects of spiritual direction and of the appropriate response to priests who have been credibly accused of sexual abuse of children and youth. The texts reviewed are available on the Courage website.

The text provided by Father McTeigue has been formatted for readability, and some typographical errors in the transcription have been corrected. Otherwise, the content of Father McTeigue's report has not been redacted and appears in its entirety.

Father Robert McTeigue

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Letter from Father McTeigue to Fr Bochanski	1
Introduction.....	2
Part One: Executive Summary.....	2
Part Two: Relevant Quotations from the Texts	5
<i>Text One:</i> “Spiritual Direction and Counseling.”	5
<i>Text Two:</i> “Reflections on a Retreat for Clerics with Homosexual Tendencies.”	7
<i>Text Three:</i> <i>The Homosexual Person: New Thinking in Pastoral Care</i> , Chapter 9: “Psychological and Pastoral Reflections on Pedophilia”	9
<i>Text Four:</i> “Group Support in Helping the Homosexual to Live a Fully Integrated Life”	10
<i>Text Five:</i> “Priests Who Stray: We Must Aid, Not Neglect Them.”	11
<i>Text Six:</i> “Homosexuality and Hope.”	16
<i>Text Seven:</i> “Pedophilia and Ephebophilia.”	18
<i>Text Eight:</i> “Spiritual Direction, Therapy, and the Directee.”	19
<i>Text Nine:</i> “Ongoing Reflections on Priest-Bishops Scandals.”	20
<i>Text Ten:</i> “An Overview of the Crisis in the Church and Contemporary Society.”	22

November 12, 2018

Dear Father Bochanski,

Attached please find the results of the analysis of certain texts written by Father Harvey that you sent me. I have undertaken this analysis at your request, and I do not expect nor wish to be compensated for this analysis.

I wish to state clearly the scope and limitation of the attached document, as well as the scope and limitation of my own knowledge and expertise:

- My work here covers only the texts you gave me, and nothing else.
- I am not aware of any advice that Father Harvey might have given any individual or group regarding the topics of pedophilia and ephebophilia covered in some of the texts you gave me.
- I never heard Father Harvey speak about the topics of pedophilia and ephebophilia, neither in person nor via any recording.
- I am not a clinical psychologist. I am not qualified to judge whether what Father Harvey wrote in these texts was consonant with the state of psychological practice at the time that he wrote these texts, spanning nearly fifty years.
- I am not a civil attorney. My study does not include or imply any consideration of any legal import that these texts may or may not have.
- I am not a canon lawyer. My study does not include or imply any consideration of any canonical import that these texts may or may not have.
- My academic training is in philosophy. I was trained how to read texts closely and to identify essential elements of an author's writings. That is the substance of my review of the texts of Father Harvey that you gave me.

Sincerely,

Father Robert McTeigue, S.J., Ph.D.

A Literature Review of Certain Texts Written by Father John Harvey

INTRODUCTION

What follows is a review of certain texts which Father Harvey had written over many years. This document is an outline of what may be gleaned therefrom to understand Father Harvey's position on the nature of pedophilia and ephebophilia, and the possibilities for responding to people who have such disorders.

Part One of this study is simply an executive summary of the elements of those texts relevant to the issues of pedophilia and ephebophilia.

Part Two of this study is a more detailed summary of the highlights of the texts supplied, so that the summary may be understood in context.

Please note that this study refers exclusively to the texts reviewed and makes no reference to any other sources. Note also that this study is a summary of what Father Harvey wrote in these texts, and does not include any explicit or implicit evaluation of the psychological, legal or canonical import of what Father Harvey wrote.

PART ONE

The salient features of the supplied texts by Father Harvey may be summarized as follows:

- Father Harvey always endorsed the fullness of the perennial teaching of the Church regarding morality.
- Father Harvey believed that Christian discipleship includes responding to the constant call to holiness.
 - A disciple's response to the call to holiness is often helped by receiving spiritual direction, where spiritual direction is understood as described in the writings of Saint Francis de Sales and Saint Teresa of Avila.

- Sometimes people have dysfunctional patterns of thought, emotion and behavior which can impede progress in the spiritual life. Such people can benefit from counseling as a way of preparing them to reach a level of healthy functioning that allows spiritual direction to become profitable.
 - It may be possible for some people to benefit from spiritual direction while also meeting with a counselor.
 - Father Harvey wished that counselors and spiritual directors could have a better knowledge and appreciation of one another's disciplines.
- Father Harvey insisted that all persons are bound to chastity, by both natural and divine law.
 - Chastity is most likely to be lived peacefully and fruitfully in the context of spiritual direction, a plan of life, chaste friendships, community support and an intense prayer life supported by the sacraments.
 - Some people may be assisted by counseling in their response to the universal call to chastity.
- People with same-sex attraction [SSA] are as bound by the obligation to chastity as anyone else. Those with SSA should avail themselves of all the natural and supernatural helps available to them to lead a chaste life. Father Harvey advocated for a program of support analogous to the 12 Steps of AA for people with SSA.
- Father Harvey did not in the texts reviewed give a precise and confident account of the origins of SSA, although he indicated that he was familiar with some of the literature that offered accounts of the origins of SSA. He appears to have advocated a 12 Step/AA program for persons with SSA because he saw SSA as a compulsion or addiction that could be brought under control, analogous to the way that an alcoholic's desire for alcohol could be brought under control. The goal of such a program is to enable the person to lead a chaste life peacefully and fruitfully.
- Father Harvey made certain distinctions regarding the abuse of minors.
 - Pedophiles are sexually attracted to minors and some may have acted upon that attraction.
 - Ephebophilia refers to sexual attraction to post-pubescent minors. Father Harvey disagreed with those who described ephebophilia as a "distinct orientation." Rather, he said that it was a sub-set of homosexuality, formed by either preference or circumstance.
 - Father Harvey further distinguished between those who are consistently and exclusively attracted to minors and those and those who have been, but not consistently and exclusively. Regarding the former, he

said that they cannot be successfully treated, and must not be returned to ministry. Moreover, he said that it was morally licit to treat such persons with Depo-Provera in order to neutralize their sex drive.

- Regarding those who have been attracted to minors, but not consistently or exclusively, Father Harvey again made distinctions. He wrote that such persons, if they have any other psychological disorder, should not be returned to ministry. He wrote that such persons, if they have no other concurrent psychological disorder, might be considered for a return to ministry, if several conditions are met. These include:
 - They have no unsupervised access to minors.
 - They continue in counseling and spiritual direction.
 - They are a member of a support group.
 - They commit to an intense life of prayer, supported by the sacraments.
 - They work a 12-step program analogous to AA.
 - They are under strict supervision of their bishop or superior.
 - The public and parish are informed of the circumstances of the return to ministry.
 - These stipulations are meant only for those who have not received a prison sentence.

- Father Harvey’s writings about care for those who have abused seemed to emerge from several commitments. These include:
 - Due consideration for justice and mercy.
 - The desire to work for a sinner’s repentance.
 - The concern that a contrite and reformed person who could conceivably minister safely (with restrictions) but was denied ministry (or laicized against his will) might despair and relapse.

- It is true that Father Harvey expressed reservations about the “zero-tolerance policy” of the Dallas Charter of 2002.

PART TWO

The second section of this study offers a more detailed review of the supplied texts of Father Harvey. The texts are reviewed herein chronologically. Note that some of the texts appear to be unpublished texts that do not give a clear indication of the date of origin or the intended audience. Other texts were published in books or journal articles, and they will be cited according to the usual academic standards.

Text One: “Spiritual Direction and Counseling.”¹

- “Counseling is the art wherein one person helps another to be more completely human, to think more clearly about himself, the world, and God, and to use his will in the highest sort of freedom to attain his supernatural goal.”²
- “Counseling, as it were, frees the will to make decisions. Counseling of necessity must precede spiritual direction. This is my thesis, that adequate direction is impossible wherever the director of souls runs into some sort of neurosis in the client.”³
- “But in these persons who had gained insight into themselves was the proper soil for real spiritual direction, which I now describe.”⁴
- “Spiritual Direction may be described as guidance of the Christian into a fuller life of Christ.”⁵
- “From this superficial delineation of the spiritual director, it is clear that there is a vast difference between counseling and spiritual direction. Counseling is basically a complex natural relationship between the counselor and the counselee: spiritual direction is basically a supernatural relationship between the priest and his Philothea (the aspirant to the devout life) in which he helps the devout soul to open up to the inspirations of the Holy Spirit.”⁶

¹ “Spiritual Direction and Counseling.” Father John Harvey. No reference to publication is found in the text itself. The latest date found in the text itself is to an article Father Harvey wrote in 1957. (The Catholic Educator, April 1957, pp. 521-525.) It appears to have been produced on a typewriter and not a computer or word processor. It is a 13-page document. Pages 3,7, and 11 are missing.

² Spiritual Direction and Counseling.” Page 1.

³ Spiritual Direction and Counseling.” Page 1.

⁴ Spiritual Direction and Counseling.” Page 1.

⁵ Spiritual Direction and Counseling.” Page 2. Emphasis in the original.

⁶ Spiritual Direction and Counseling.” Page 2. Emphasis in the original.

- “the task of the counselor is to help the individual see himself as he really is, in the light of that knowledge to understand whether he is capable of aiming at the goal which he desires, or whether he should aim lower or higher.”⁷
- “As already asserted, all counseling is directive. It is really a question of what degree of direction should be given to different persons with different problems.”⁸
- “It is clear from the superficial review [of] spiritual direction that many of the approaches used can also be applied to counseling. For example, St. Francis does not compromise moral precepts, but he sweetens them. By ‘sweetening’ is meant to make something more attractive or at least, to mitigate its bitterness. His art consisted in sweetening everything without attenuating anything. But there is one last difference between counseling and spiritual direction which is found in the writings of St. Francis de Sales. It is this. In counseling one remains at a distance from the client, and prudently so, lest he form an unhealthy emotional attachment for the counselor. (I refer to something more permanent than the transfer phenomenon.) And spiritual direction, however, one can form a holy friendship, as St. Francis advises the aspirant so to do with her director: **‘trusting him with the love of the daughter for a father, esteem him with the confidence of a son towards his mother; in short, let this friendship be at once loving and firm, wholly sacred, divine, spiritual, holy.’** (Devout Life, Part I, Chapter 3.)”⁹
- “From the foregoing considerations it is clear that counseling is distinct from spiritual direction in the following ways: (1) counseling is concerned with helping someone to make a truly free decision about some problem in his life, usually involving emotional factors which have beclouded the judgment and impeded the will of the counselee; spiritual direction is concerned with helping someone to live an ascetical life once he has made the free decision to do so: (2) counseling is basically a natural process of growth in the counselee in which natural methods are used to bring about insight; spiritual direction is basically a supernatural activity in which the director leads the directed to a deeper spiritual life both seeking the light of the Holy Ghost; (3) there is more permissiveness in counseling than in spiritual direction, because in this climate the immature counselee has more opportunity for true self-knowledge. In spiritual direction it is assumed that the soul is already naturally mature and so ready to accept direction from someone more experienced in the spir-

⁷ Spiritual Direction and Counseling.” Page 4.

⁸ Spiritual Direction and Counseling.” Page 8. Emphasis in the original.

⁹ Spiritual Direction and Counseling.” Page 12. Emphasis in the original.

itual life; (4) in counseling resistance is an expected psychological phenomena to be treated therapeutically; in spiritual direction, ordinarily, resistance is a sign that the director should go back to counseling, because the individual lacks the maturity necessary for obedience; (5) the counseling relationship should end as soon as the counselee is able to think clearly and to act freely in the problem presented; and spiritual direction the relationship may go on until death as one form of beautiful friendship, out of which has come much spiritual growth for both director and directed, as witness the lives of St. Francis de Sales in St. Jane de Chantal, or blessed Claude de la Columbiere and St. Margaret Mary, or many others...”¹⁰

Text Two: “Reflections on a Retreat for Clerics with Homosexual Tendencies.”¹¹

- “On the evening of February 20, 1978 four priests and a permanent deacon began an 11-day retreat under my direction. Ranging in age from 35 to 59, these men came from places as distant as California and Nova Scotia. All five came with the expectation that a retreat might help them to bring homosexual tendencies under control.”¹²
- “During this early phase it was necessary to call members of the group back from psychological theorizing or ‘headtripping’. This tendency could have been dangerous were it not for the presence of a clinical psychologist from Catholic University, Dr. John F. Kinnane, who spent eight hours during the retreat and helping the retreat tends to understand better the psychological aspects and the limitations of any psychological method for the full personal integration of the homosexual. The significance of his contribution will become clear as I record subsequent events.”¹³
- “Eventually, when the other members complained that they felt we were bogged down, I turned the attention of the group to the spiritual dimensions inherent in the 12 steps of Alcoholics Anonymous.”¹⁴

¹⁰ Spiritual Direction and Counseling.” Page 12. Emphasis in the original.

¹¹ “Reflections on a Retreat for Clerics with Homosexual Tendencies.” Father John Harvey. (Linacre Quarterly, May 1979, pp. 136-140.).

¹² “Reflections on a Retreat for Clerics with Homosexual Tendencies.” Page 136.

¹³ “Reflections on a Retreat for Clerics with Homosexual Tendencies.” Page 137.

¹⁴ “Reflections on a Retreat for Clerics with Homosexual Tendencies.” Page 138.

- “During the 11 full days [the] following points were covered: 1) admission of natural helplessness over the personal condition; 2) willingness to turn one’s life over to a caring God; 3) actual decision to surrender one’s life to God; and 4) a moral inventory of the past with resolutions for the future.”¹⁵
- “In my judgment, the most powerful catalysts in the psychodynamics of the retreat were the insights of a homosexual layman, who, after seven years in this gay subculture has been living a chaste life during the last 25 years. The retreatants were able to identify with him. He saw through the rationalizations of several members who are inclined to cling to homosexual lovers; he talked ‘cold turkey’ with more authority than Dr. Kinnane or myself. Although at first frightened by his apparent rigor, they came to realize that he possessed a wisdom rooted in both worldly experience and deep spirituality. He stressed the importance of spiritual direction and relating the fact they had he come regularly to me for 25 years.”¹⁶
- “REFLECTIONS: At this early stage it is difficult to assess the complete benefits of the retreats. Although it was an exhausting experience, the participants left with the feeling of hope for the future. In each person there was a sense that some other homosexual persons ‘understand how I feel, and I can reveal myself to them, and I need not be concerned that I will lose their friendship’.”¹⁷
- “As each person listened to the agony of the others, each came to realize that ‘gay is not good’. Each also realize that he would have to find the kind of friends he made during the retreat. He must find a spiritual director, since the problem was recognized not only a psychological, but also as deeply spiritual.”¹⁸
- “CONCLUSION: In this article I have indicated some of the spiritual elements entering into the control of homosexual activity. The pilot retreats show that the answer to homosexual involvement for clerics and religious may be practically resolved by planning and living a spiritual life rather than by concentrating on sexual re-orientation, which, generally at this time in life, can mean nothing more than some form of control over sexual desires.”¹⁹

¹⁵ “Reflections on a Retreat for Clerics with Homosexual Tendencies.” Page 139.

¹⁶ “Reflections on a Retreat for Clerics with Homosexual Tendencies.” Page 139.

¹⁷ “Reflections on a Retreat for Clerics with Homosexual Tendencies.” Page 140. (Emphasis in the original.)

¹⁸ “Reflections on a Retreat for Clerics with Homosexual Tendencies.” Page 140. (Emphasis in the original.)

¹⁹ “Reflections on a Retreat for Clerics with Homosexual Tendencies.” Page 140. (Emphasis in the original.)

Text Three: The Homosexual Person: New Thinking in Pastoral Care, Chapter 9: “Psychological and Pastoral Reflections on Pedophilia”²⁰

- “I do not doubt that celibates may have the obligation to use D-P [Depo-Provera] to avoid relapses, but they also have a duty to use both individual counseling and spiritual group support systems. They need to integrate the human wisdom of therapy with the principles of the Gospel, understood in a life of prayer. The Christian homosexual pedophile needs a spiritual plan of life even more than the ordinary homosexual does, because his spiritual survival depends upon it. It is not enough, then, to propose medication, counseling, and support systems to the celibate homosexual pedophile. The spiritual dimension is not just another dimension, but the all-important motivator to use all possible natural means to regain control over one’s sexuality so that it may be used properly in the service of the Lord. If such a celibate is sincere, he will find a spiritual director in addition to his professional counselor and group support system.”²¹
- “For several years I have been engaged in what is best described as *crisis intervention*, working with clinical psychologist John F Kinnane, of Catholic University, Dr. Richard Fitzgibbons of Philadelphia, and with treatment centers in the rehabilitation of clerics and religious who had become emotionally and sexually involved with boys or adolescent males. It is a program involving regular clinical counseling, participation in group retreats, attendance at A.A. or S.A. meetings, and vigilant pastoral supervision of the counselee. With the explicit permission of those with whom Dr. Kinnane and I have worked, we have been able to share our perception of them and to help fourteen clerics get some measure of control over their lives. Our shared clinical and counseling oppression is that these persons have not grown up psychologically, morally, or spiritually. Psychologically, they are like little boys; morally, they lack sensitivity concerning the damage they may have done to these young people; and spiritually, they have lost contact with God in the depths of their souls.”²²
- “We are therefore dealing with more than a physical and psychological disorder; it is a profoundly spiritual crisis, and all that has been already said in describing a spiritual program such as A.A for homosexual persons applies preeminently to the pedophile. He has to live the Twelve Steps. In my role as

²⁰ The Homosexual Person: New Thinking in Pastoral Care. Father John Harvey. Ignatius Press. First Edition. 1987. (Hereafter, THP.)

²¹ THP. Page 226.

²² THP. Page 226.

spiritual director, I see my counselees at regular intervals. There is hope, then, for the homosexual pedophile who is willing to cooperate with professionals and spiritual directors. But he must realize that every step he takes back to spiritual sanity is possible only by the grace of God.”²³

Text Four: “Group Support in Helping the Homosexual to Live a Fully Integrated Life”²⁴

- “I would reduce the elements in a celibate life to four: (1) prayer; (2) inner discipline; (3) reception of the sacraments; and (4) group support. Already in other places I have treated the first three, and more recently I have expressed my method of direction in two pamphlets: ‘Pastoral Care of the Homosexual’, The Knights of Columbus, No. 85, 1978; and ‘A Spiritual Plan to Redirect One’s Life’, Daughters of St. Paul, 1979. In this article I should like to develop the importance of group support. From 13 retreats given to priests and brothers over the past three years ... I have noted that individuals who thought they had no control over homosexual tendencies have come to realize that chastity is practically possible for them. They are willing to struggle against their desires for genital acts. They have found they can have intimacy and friendship without the need for genital expression. This is not to say that the process of group support is a form of cure-all. Persons aspiring to the chaste life may fail now and then, but they know better how to get back to an ascetical way of life through the support of a group.”²⁵
- “In this respect there is a legitimate comparison between homosexual support groups and Alcoholics Anonymous.”²⁶
- “In mentioning ‘compulsive activity’ several distinctions are relevant. Not all, or even most homosexual activity is compulsive, but some is. When a man in public life risks his political career to have sex in a public restroom, he is hardly acting with human freedom. Again, compulsive activity is very complex, so that no one can really understand compulsive activity unless he knows the person’s background. Finally, homosexuals whose activity has become compulsive derive more benefit than others from group spiritual direction. Nonetheless, it is

²³ THP. Pages 226-227.

²⁴ “Group Support in Helping the Homosexual to Live a Fully Integrated Life” Father John Harvey. This is a 5-page typewritten document, obviously prepared for publication, with no indication of where (or whether) it was published. It is hand-annotated, “1981.”

²⁵ “Group Support in Helping the Homosexual to Live a Fully Integrated Life.” Page 2. Emphasis in the original.

²⁶ “Group Support in Helping the Homosexual to Live a Fully Integrated Life.” Page 2.

also beneficial to the person who is trying to move from a steady lover situation to complete abstinence from genital activity, as I learned more recently.”²⁷

- “But there is a human aspect to celibacy which should be considered. Celibacy demands that only that you be part of a community of support, but that you form deep friendships with others who share your goals. The homosexual person needs such friendships, because more often than not he is a lonely person who is had difficulty throughout his life in sustaining deep relationships.”²⁸

Text Five: “Priests Who Stray: We Must Aid, Not Neglect Them.”²⁹

- “In recent decades, the church in America has suffered numerous scandals involving priests and religious who sexually abuse children. All too often, the public learns that an abuser, once discovered, was allowed simply to flee to another ministry, where the pattern of abuse and flight was repeated. Such cases constitute serious neglect by Church authorities, and they have understandably resulted in scandals damaging to the Church’s reputation and its financial health.”³⁰
- “Church officials now tend to respond quite differently when cases of child sex abuse arise. Unfortunately, they often substitute a new form of neglect for the old. Rather than concentrating on rehabilitating troubled priests, authorities too often merely ‘shelve’ them, permitting them only the ministry of private Mass and/or pushing hard for their immediate laicization.”³¹
- “Let me state that I emphatically agreed with the church’s teachings on sexual matters. That is why I founded Courage, the support group for persons tempted to homosexual behavior who seek to live chaste lives. And I realize that soft-pedaling traditional morality often only encourages persons with sexual disorders to deny their problem. Still, as Christians we are called to love all people. With love comes responsibility, especially for those in need, as we all are, of the healing of Christ. The new pattern of neglect for clerical child abusers, I

²⁷ “Group Support in Helping the Homosexual to Live a Fully Integrated Life.” Page 3.

²⁸ “Group Support in Helping the Homosexual to Live a Fully Integrated Life.” Page 3.

²⁹ “Priests Who Stray: We Must Aid, Not Neglect Them.” (Hereafter, “Priests Who Stray.”) Father John Harvey. Crisis Magazine, November 1, 1992. Last accessed online at <https://www.crisismagazine.com/1992/priests-who-stray-we-must-aid-not-neglect-them-on-11.04.18>. Online text transferred to a Word document, nine pages in length. Pagination will follow from that document.

³⁰ “Priests Who Stray.” Page 1.

³¹ “Priests Who Stray.” Page 1.

believe, is at least as dangerous for the church as the old one, and it is just as negligent in its handling of the offenders.”³²

- “With this in mind, at the Ninth Bishops’ Workshop in Dallas, I spoke in February 1990 on the moral aspects of addiction and addressed the question whether some previously been involved in sexual activity with youths could be restored to restricted ministry under carefully qualified conditions. Now I should like to add to the arguments I presented in Dallas in favor of a more hopeful view of priests and religious who had been involved in such behavior. I anticipate the objection that I am concerned only with those who were the perpetrators of such acts, and not the victims. I assure the reader I have also worked with the victims, helping them to receive both therapy and spiritual direction, and I can empathize with their trauma. While keeping all aspects of the problem in mind, however, I wish to concentrate here on priests or religious who have been involved in acts properly termed pedophilic or ephebophilic. Although I write primarily as a moral theologian, examining moral aspects of the problems, I am fully aware of their canonical and legal aspects.”³³
- “Experts further distinguish between the conditions of *fixated* pedophilia and *regressed* pedophilia. A person whose overwhelming sexual interest is in little children, and no other age group, would be diagnosed as fixated, and his prognosis would be very poor. Relatively few priests who have been involved with young boys fit into the category of fixated pedophilia. Most priests have been classified in the category called regressed pedophilia because their behavior for a variety of reasons was a regression from adult behavior, and they are capable of relating to peers or older persons.”³⁴
- “It is crucial that a clinical psychologist/psychiatrist diagnosing an offender render an opinion on the probability or improbability of the priest/religious returning to restricted ministry after a period of spiritual and psychological rehabilitation. This diagnosis may take time. If the clinical judgment is that the person is a *fixated* pedophile or ephebophile, then he should not be restored to any pastoral ministry. And of course, if the clinical judgment is that the person should not be given any restricted ministry because of other psychological difficulties, authorities will be bound in conscience to follow the advice of the clinicians in the rehabilitation center. If, however, the clinical judgment indicates that it is very probable that the individual will be able to function well in restricted ministry under carefully qualified conditions, then it seems that his bishop or provincial ought to give him the opportunity to do so. Here I refer to

³² “Priests Who Stray.” Page 1.

³³ “Priests Who Stray.” Page 1,

³⁴ “Priests Who Stray.” Page 2. Emphasis in the original.

a priest or religious who has truly internalized the Twelve Step Program – the heart of which is faith and prayer – so that he keeps himself at a distance from any unsupervised contact with youth.”³⁵

- “There are several conditions for ministry reintegration. After a period of residential therapy that ends with a favorable prognosis, the process of reintegration must include: (1) continuing psychological therapy; (2) attendance at Twelve Step Programs, like Sexaholics Anonymous or Courage; (3) regular spiritual direction; and (4) careful supervision of restricted pastoral ministry. Father Alan Placa of the Rockville Centre diocese specifies similar conditions and adds a point that I believe needs emphasis: ‘There should be no unsupervised contact with youngsters in the particular age group for a specified period of time’.”³⁶
- “Using a program of this design, Father Placa has had success in reintegrating into restricted ministry priests who were not fixated pedophiles or who had not served terms in prison for criminal offenses. The success of the Saint Luke Institute Program in Suitland, Maryland, should also not be overlooked. Dr. Frank Valcour, medical director, reports that 32 of 55 child molesters who had completed treatment by September 1989, were doing well, with no reported instances of relapse and no new allegations of child molestation.”
- “Valcour concludes that, after making allowances for the possibility of some improper behavior which was not reported and for individuals who are impaired in other ways and thus not fit for future ministry, the majority of those treated have attained a new level of psychological and spiritual health. It would seem, then, that the risk of relapse will continue to be minimal and that these men should be re-assigned to ministry under carefully qualified conditions. The risk of relapse for such priests is much lower than it is for priests and religious who – after going through the process of rehabilitation and receiving a favorable prognosis – are not allowed to engage in any ministry.”³⁷
- “Can we really avoid risks to our present policy of total non-reintegration? Dr. Valcour responds: ‘This extreme position fails to recognize that no decision is without risks.’ Indeed, the current policy of removing such priests from all ministry and from the public celebration of Mass does nothing for their spiritual and psychological healing and places them in greater danger of relapse than a policy of restricted ministry.”³⁸

³⁵ “Priests Who Stray.” Page 2. Emphasis in the original.

³⁶ “Priests Who Stray.” Pages 2-3.

³⁷ “Priests Who Stray.” Page 3.

³⁸ “Priests Who Stray.” Page 3.

- “With regard to the civil law and courts of justice one may speculate whether the law would support the return to ministry of a priest who has done everything he is asked to do (therapy, group support, spiritual direction, pastoral supervision). Under such circumstances might the diocese in all likelihood *not* be held responsible in the event of a relapse? In our civil law most questions cannot be answered with certainty, only with probabilities. Nonetheless, Robert W McMenamín and William P. Kralovec, who have worked with clergymen of various denominations, judge that the religious institute would be protected if it followed the conditions I have described. Still, in the event of relapse there will be a measure of uncertainty if there is a trial by jury. The jury would have to decide whether the religious authority acted in a reasonable manner under the circumstances. McMenamín and Kralovec are confident that such a jury would be fair.”³⁹
- “In light of their legal experience with such cases, McMenamín and Kralovec have some helpful observations about the necessity of rehabilitation and the good effects flowing from it. They stress the importance of finding employment for the offender: ‘Failure to find employment for an offender increases the punishment and may be totally unfair. Both justice and charity require looking for an environment where the reformed offender can function successfully and use his or her talents to full advantage’.”⁴⁰
- “To repeat, the difficulty of many priests involved in sexual activity with youth is one of human weakness, not malice. When discovered, the weakness must be treated with professional therapy and strong spiritual support programs; it is hardly the time to apply canonical legislation concerning the delicts and penalties, all of which presuppose that the priest/religious possessed both full awareness of the meaning of his acts and full freedom not to perform such acts. The collective experience of clinical psychologists and of pastoral counselors like myself is that these priests and religious did not possess the full freedom to which the canons apply.”⁴¹
- “In my Dallas paper I developed the thesis that sexual addiction reduced the imputability of many priests and religious involved in sexual acts with youths. If one grants that each individual act must be evaluated in terms of the person’s awareness of the meaning of the act, as well as the degree of freedom he possessed at that time, one may conclude that many priests and religious did not possess the kind of knowledge or the degree of freedom necessary to incur ca-

³⁹ “Priests Who Stray.” Page 4.

⁴⁰ “Priests Who Stray.” Pages 4-5.

⁴¹ “Priests Who Stray.” Page 5.

nonical penalties. In such situations, it seems that ordinaries and religious superiors have the duty to see that these men receive residential therapy with proper aftercare, and, contingent upon the diagnosis and prognosis of professionals in the field, an opportunity for restricted ministry in the service of the Church.”⁴²

- “As matters stand now, many priests receive no encouragement from their ordinaries come back to restricted ministry; on the contrary, pressure is put on them to seek laicization. Desiring some form of pastoral ministry, many gather together in a spiritual support program to maintain a life of prayer with Christ and to encourage one another in keeping alive the sense of priesthood and religious life. Many are allowed to say a private Mass every day. Again, there is always the risk of relapse and possible financial liability for the diocese, but one can make the distinction between low risk and high risk. Where professional therapists have advised against restoring the man to ministry, there is high risk; the bishop then acts prudently in not allowing the priest to resume ministry. But if the same therapists advocate restoration to restricted ministry under qualified conditions, it seems that the bishops should respond favorably to such counsel.”⁴³
- “As for scandalizing those who know the priest’s past, I have found that most people are edified, and view the priest’s or religious’ endeavor to change his way of life as a work of the Spirit, as conversion. If laypersons are properly informed concerning the rehabilitation process (which is similar to Alcoholics Anonymous), and if they are aware of the priest’s or religious’ determination to pursue his vocation, then they will be scandalized if superiors refused to give him hope to be what he has promised to be.”⁴⁴
- “The present policy of many American bishops concerning priests involved in pedophilic or ephebophilic acts is unfairly different from their policies concerning alcoholics, drug addicts, or promiscuous heterosexual priests. These latter are often encouraged to continue ministry in another diocese after proper rehabilitation. To be sure, in such instances the risk of financial liability is not as great. Should, then, the financial risk be the determining criterion in allowing one priest to continue ministry in his own or another diocese, and not allowing another to so? Proper treatment for priests who have been involved in sexual

⁴² “Priests Who Stray.” Page 6.

⁴³ “Priests Who Stray.” Pages 6-7.

⁴⁴ “Priests Who Stray.” Page 7.

activity with youths reduces the risk of relapse just as effectively as proper treatment for heterosexual offenders. In all these situations, treatment facilities aim to overcome different forms of addiction.”⁴⁵

- “Besides compassion, however, there must also be responsibility. This means getting to the truth of a difficult situation, while firmly maintaining the principle that a person is innocent until proven guilty. It also means a search for appropriate remedies, and eventually reconciliation through the actions of an authorized representative of the Church.”⁴⁶
- “...a thesis of hope that some priests can be returned to restricted ministry under carefully qualified conditions, such as proposed in my article.”⁴⁷

Text Six: “Homosexuality and Hope.”⁴⁸

- “There are certainly circumstances such as psychological disorders and traumatic experiences which can, at times, render this chastity more difficult and there are conditions which can seriously diminish an individual’s responsibility for lapses in chastity. These circumstances and conditions, however, do not negate free will or eliminate the power of grace.”⁴⁹
- “The research referenced in this report counters the myth that same-sex attraction is genetically predetermined and unchangeable and offers hope for prevention and treatment.”⁵⁰
- “Healthy psycho-sexual development leads naturally to attraction persons of each sex for the other sex. Trauma, erroneous education, and sin can cause a deviation from this pattern.”⁵¹
- “It is, therefore, probably wise to avoid wherever possible using the words ‘homosexual’ and ‘heterosexual’ as nouns since such usage implies a fixed state and an equivalence between the natural state of man and woman as created by God and persons experiencing same-sex attractions behaviors.”⁵²

⁴⁵ “Priests Who Stray.” Page 7.

⁴⁶ “Priests Who Stray.” Page 7.

⁴⁷ “Priests Who Stray.” Page 9.

⁴⁸ “Homosexuality and Hope.” (2000) Catholic Medical Association. This document is unsigned and no author is identified. It is uncertain what Father Harvey’s contribution is to the document. At its end, under “Resources” is listed contact information for both Courage and Encourage.

⁴⁹ “Hope and Homosexuality.” Pages 1-2.

⁵⁰ “Hope and Homosexuality.” Page 2.

⁵¹ “Hope and Homosexuality.” Page 3.

⁵² “Hope and Homosexuality.” Page 3.

- “For a Catholic with same-sex attraction, the goal of therapy should be freedom to live chastely according to one’s state in life. Some of those who have struggled with same-sex attractions believe that they are called to a celibate life. They should not be made to feel they have failed to achieve freedom, because they do not experience desires for the other sex. Others wish to marry and have children. There is every reason to hope that many will be able, in time, to achieve this goal. They should not, however, be encouraged to rush into marriage, since there is ample evidence that marriage is not a cure for same-sex attractions. With the power of grace, the sacraments, support from the community, and an experienced therapist, a determined individual should be able to achieve the inner freedom promised by Christ.”⁵³
- “There is every reason for hope that with time those who seek freedom will find it, but we must recognize when we encourage hope, there are some who will not achieve their goals. We may find ourselves in the same position as a pediatric oncologist who spoke of how when he first began practice, there was almost no hope for children stricken with cancer and the physician’s duty was to help the parents accept the inevitable and not waste their resources chasing a ‘cure’. Today almost 70% of the children recover, but each death leaves the medical team with terrible feeling of failure. As the prevention and treatment of same-sex attraction improves, the individuals who still struggle will, more than ever, need compassionate and sensitive support.”⁵⁴
- “The priest needs to be aware of the depth of healing needed by these seriously conflicted persons. He needs to be a source of hope for the despairing, forgiveness for the erring, strength for the weak, encouragement for the faint of heart, sometimes a loving father figure for the wounded. In brief, he must be Jesus for these beloved children of God who find themselves in most difficult situations. He must be pastorally sensitive, but he must also be pastorally firm, imitating, as always, the compassionate Jesus who healed and forgave seventy times seven times, but always reminded, ‘Go and do not commit this sin again’.”⁵⁵
- “Teachers in Catholic institutions have a duty to defend the teachings of the Church on sexual morality, to counter false information on same-sex attraction, to inform at-risk or homosexually involved adolescents that help is available. They should continue to resist pressure to include condom education the curriculum to accommodate homosexually active adolescents.”⁵⁶

⁵³ “Hope and Homosexuality.” Page 9.

⁵⁴ “Hope and Homosexuality.” Pages 9-10.

⁵⁵ “Hope and Homosexuality.” Page 15.

⁵⁶ “Hope and Homosexuality.” Page 17.

- “‘Gay’ rights activists have insisted that at-risk adolescents be turned over to support groups which will help them ‘come out’. There is no evidence that participation in such groups prevents the long-term negative consequences associated with homosexual activity. Such groups will definitely not encourage the adolescent to refrain from sin and live chastely according to his state in life.”⁵⁷

Text Seven: “Pedophilia and Ephebophilia.”⁵⁸

- “Pedophilia is found in adults who seek genital sex from children below the age of puberty. A comparatively young adult of twenty years would be a pedophile were he to seek genital sex from a child of ten. In the present situation, a cleric or religious who seeks genital sex from prepubescent children is a fixated pedophile. ‘Fixated’ means that the adult person seeks only such children. The prognosis for such a person is very poor, that is to say, there is little hope of the person can be cured. It is a form of obsessive-compulsive activity.”⁵⁹
- “There is another kind of pedophilia – termed *lapsed* or *regressed*. It is found in adults who ordinarily are able to relate in a wholesome way to others, but under the influence of drugs or alcohol regress into a pedophilic act with a child. The prognosis for such a priest is good, provided the person regains sobriety”⁶⁰
- “Among clerics and religious, fixated pedophilia is very rare (.3% [Philip Jenkins, *Pedophiles and Priests: Anatomy of a Contemporary Crisis*, New York: Oxford University Press, 1995]); regressed pedophilia is also rare among clerics and religious.”⁶¹
- “We turn now to ephebophilia. The term refers to homosexual men and women who seek genital sexual with post-pubescent teenagers. Like pedophilia, it is found among both clergy and laity. To be sure, some writers speak of ephebophilia as a basic orientation, that is to say, some clerics have a fixation only to teenage boys. Germain Grisez and I have not found this to be so in our research and pastoral experience. Indeed, the term is not found in the *Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of the American Psychiatric*

⁵⁷ “Hope and Homosexuality.” Page 17.

⁵⁸ “Pedophilia and Ephebophilia—Differences and Distinctions.” (Hereafter, “Pedophilia and Ephebophilia.”) Father John Harvey. *Ethics & Medics: Communique of The National Catholic Bioethics Center and the Life Sciences* (October 2002, Volume 27, Number 10, pages 1-2.)

⁵⁹ “Pedophilia and Ephebophilia.” Page 1.

⁶⁰ “Pedophilia and Ephebophilia.” Page 1. Emphasis in the original.

⁶¹ “Pedophilia and Ephebophilia.” Page 1. Footnote in the original changed to reference in brackets.

Association (IV). It seems that there is no real distinction between an adult homosexual having genital sexual with a teenager and an adult ephebophilic seeking sex with a teenager.”⁶²

- “Again, the media further confuses the issue by calling priests and religious seeking genital sex from teenagers ‘pedophiles’, carefully avoiding the reality that, in many cases, active homosexual priests were involved with teenagers.”⁶³
- “The fixated pedophile priest should be taken out of ministry, lest other children be harmed.”⁶⁴
- “During the late seventies and eighties, while teaching in Washington, D.C., I give spiritual direction to groups of priests with homosexual difficulties. I believe that psychological assistance must be integrated with spiritual and moral considerations. I have witnessed improvement in the pedophilic priests who followed basic spiritual guidelines. This was also true of priests who had been involved with teenagers.”⁶⁵
- “I must point out that the distinction between the pedophilic cleric and the priest with same-sex attractions who had genital sex with teenagers is pastorally important, because the chances that the priest who had sought teenagers for sex will be able to be chaste are much greater. I know this from many years of counseling priests along the East Coast. From 1978 to 1990, I regularly gave retreats to priests and brothers who were struggling with homosexual desires. Very few were pedophiles. The vast majority were attracted to both adults and teenagers.”⁶⁶

Text Eight: “Spiritual Direction, Therapy, and the Directee.”⁶⁷

- “Often the spiritual director and therapist are set in opposition to one another by the directee, who keeps one or the other in the dark, or sets one against the other, although perhaps unconsciously. As a result, neither the

⁶² “Pedophilia and Ephebophilia.” Page 1.

⁶³ “Pedophilia and Ephebophilia.” Page 1.

⁶⁴ “Pedophilia and Ephebophilia.” Page 1.

⁶⁵ “Pedophilia and Ephebophilia.” Page 1.

⁶⁶ “Pedophilia and Ephebophilia.” Page 1.

⁶⁷ “Spiritual Direction, Therapy, and the Directee.” (Hereafter, “SDTD.”) W. Jerome Bracken, C.P., Maria R. Valdes, Ph.D., and John F. Harvey, O.S.F.S. A 12-page paper, without indication of where it may have been presented or published. In the introduction the paper is described as follows: “It is, in summary form, part of a book we are writing.” There is no clear indication of who contributed what to the paper. The paper is undated. The latest reference in the paper is dated 2001.

therapist or the spiritual director can find an opportunity and a way of presenting to the directee's manipulative tendencies, which are inhibiting his psychological and spiritual growth."⁶⁸

-
- “Failure to recognize that a difficulty is both a psychological and spiritual problem is a fatal mistake. When a spiritual director sends a directee to therapy and does not continue working with them, he ipso facto abandons the directee in his pursuit of spiritual growth, and even undermines the therapy itself, since the spiritual director expresses no interest in the directee's progress. As a result, both psychological and spiritual progress and maturity are jeopardized.”⁶⁹

Text Nine: “Ongoing Reflections on Priest-Bishops Scandals.”⁷⁰

- “Although one priest involved in sexual relations with teenage boys is one priest too many, still it should be stressed that the number of priests who have seduced teenage boys is a very small percentage of the 47,000-odd priests in the U.S.A.. One report said that 177 priests throughout the USA have been removed from ministry. This of course is the source of serious scandal, which is made even greater by the anger of Catholic laity, who hold that our bishops have covered up these situations, and have made immense payments to settle law suits [*sic*] made by victims and their families. But one may ask whether our bishops *as a body* have been judged too harshly by both the media and our Catholic laity.”⁷¹
- “I believe that many of them followed the advice of psychologists and psychiatrists at various treatment centers. They were told that a priest who was now living a chaste life, and engaged in priestly ministry which did not involve children or adolescents, could do good work for the church in many forms of pastoral work and spiritual direction which did not bring him in contact with youth and children. I was asked to give spiritual direction to such priests. I saw true spiritual progress in the lives of these priests. Most of them remained faithful to their promise of celibacy.”⁷²
- “In short, the predominant view of the bishops in the 80's and 90's was that such men should be given a second chance which included group spiritual

⁶⁸ “SDTD.” Page 2.

⁶⁹ “SDTD.” Page 3.

⁷⁰ “Ongoing Reflections on Priest-Bishops Scandals.” (Hereafter, “Ongoing Reflections.”) Father John Harvey. Fellowship of Catholic Scholars Quarterly. Spring 2002, pages 7-15. Emphasis in the original.

⁷¹ “Ongoing Reflections.” Page 8.

⁷² “Ongoing Reflections.” Page 8.

support, individual spiritual direction, and careful supervision. From personal pastoral experience, I saw good things happening with these priests. I was also aware that some of these bishops took good care of the youth who would have been victimized by priests. The bishops acted in good faith, in accordance with the psychological advice they received from professionals in the field.”⁷³

- “Nevertheless, many in the Church feel that these measures are necessary for the common good of Church, that is to say, that priests who had a falling many years ago, but had been faithful over subsequent years should be banished from priestly ministry for the rest of their lives. I have grave difficulty with this opinion. Serious as these sins committed with male youth are, does it mean that in the view of the public, they may never again act as priests? Are we giving into public opinion when it denies that God’s grace can restore an errant priest to ministry in the Church? Granted, there is a possibility that he could fall again, but this is not probable in the case of most priests who have sought to remain chaste. Meanwhile, should not both clergy and laity find some gainful employment for the above priests? I think we should do so.”⁷⁴
- “In January 1971, American Ecclesiastical Review, I offered an opinion [on the Vatican instruction on homosexual inclinations and seminary admission] which I reinforced in *Lay Witness* (March 2001). I hope that the homosexual inclination in itself should not be viewed as an impediment to ordination to the Catholic priesthood.”⁷⁵
- “Meanwhile, many priests who have demonstrated great virtue over many years after original lapses will remain without any kind of ministry in the Church. Are we as Church ignoring the reality of God’s grace that has worked in their lives? John Paul II referred to the divine graces that bring about conversion in sinners. But are these priests to be cast out because their serious sins of years ago are unforgivable?”⁷⁶
- “Grisez is on target in holding that a bishop’s first concern in dealing with an offending cleric must be ‘the good of the cleric’s soul’. This is in line with the Holy Father’s address on April 23, 2002: ‘We can not forget the power of Christian conversion, that radical decision to turn away from sin

⁷³ “Ongoing Reflections.” Page 8.

⁷⁴ “Ongoing Reflections.” Page 8. Emphasis in the original.

⁷⁵ “Ongoing Reflections.” Page 8.

⁷⁶ “Ongoing Reflections.” Page 13.

and back to God...’ The bishop should treat the offending cleric with pastoral mercy and help him to change his way of living.”⁷⁷

Text Ten: “An Overview of the Crisis in the Church and Contemporary Society.”⁷⁸

- Regarding the November 2005 Vatican document, [*Instruction Concerning the Criteria for the Discernment of Vocations with regard to Persons with Homosexual Tendencies in view of their Admission to the Seminary and to Holy Orders*] “While the November 2005 Document has been explicitly approved by the Church and backed by the Pope’s authority, will the same thing happened with the November 2005 Document as happened with *Humanae Vitae* in 1968? Will official representatives of the church be allowed to reject the doctrine and the directives of the Document with impunity?”⁷⁹

⁷⁷ “Ongoing Reflections.” Page 14.

⁷⁸ “An Overview of the Crisis in the Church and in Our Contemporary Society.” (Hereafter, “Overview.”) Father John Harvey. A 10-page document (in addition, an outline designated as page 0). Hand annotated as written by Father Harvey in 2006. Text includes notes in Father Harvey’s hand. No indication as to whether the paper was every presented or published.”

⁷⁹ “Overview.” Page 7.